

**The effects of dust grains in
two dissimilar regions at
opposite ends of the Milky Way**

A thesis submitted to The University of Manchester for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
in the Faculty of Engineering and Physical Sciences

2006

Paul Ruffle
School of Physics and Astronomy

Contents

Abstract	7
Declaration	8
Copyright Statement	9
Dedication	11
Acknowledgements	12
The Author	14
Supporting Publications	15
1 Our Dusty Universe	17
I Determination of extinction towards the Galactic bulge	25
2 Planetary Nebulae	27
2.1 Overview	27
2.2 Introduction	28
2.3 Observations and data processing	32
2.4 Filter wavelength shift with angle of incidence	41
3 PNe Diameter Determinations	43
3.1 Method	43
3.2 Image restoration	45
3.3 Results	49
3.4 Discussion	52

CONTENTS

4	PNe Flux Determinations	63
4.1	Method	63
4.2	Results and error factors	68
5	PNe Extinction Determinations	77
5.1	Theory	77
5.2	Method I	80
5.3	Method II	82
5.4	Brightness temperature	83
5.5	Results	84
6	Discussion: Extinction	91
6.1	Evidence for anomalous extinction	91
6.2	Extinction and the warm ionized medium	94
6.3	Grain sizes	96
7	PNe Conclusions	99
7.1	Angular diameters	99
7.2	Fluxes	99
7.3	Extinction	100
7.4	Further work	101
II	Metal-poor molecular gas in Galactic edge clouds	103
8	Galactic Edge Clouds	105
8.1	Overview	105
8.2	Introduction	106
8.3	Spectral line observations of EC2	114
8.4	Spectral line observations of EC1	122
8.5	Spectral line data reduction	129

8.6	Spectral line mapping of EC2	132
8.7	Dust mapping of EC2 and EC1	137
9	Analysis of EC2 Observations	141
9.1	Beam deconvolution	141
9.2	Ammonia as a thermometer	143
9.3	Determination of temperature	147
9.4	Determination of density	148
9.5	Determination of molecular abundances	153
9.6	Determination of dust to gas ratio and mass	157
10	Analysis of EC1 Observations	163
10.1	Summary	163
11	Molecular Cloud Comparisons	167
11.1	Molecular abundances relative to HCO^+	167
11.2	Molecular abundances relative to H_2	168
11.3	Comparison with local molecular clouds	168
11.4	Comparison with translucent clouds	169
11.5	Comparison of EC1 with EC2	169
12	Chemical Modelling of EC2	173
12.1	Method	173
12.2	Results	175
12.3	Fractional abundances over time	181
13	Edge Cloud Conclusions	199
13.1	Edge Cloud 2	199
13.2	Edge Cloud 1	203
13.3	Further edge cloud work	204

CONTENTS

III Appendices	205
A Additional PNe image plots	207
B EC2 map observations at the JCMT 15m telescope May-July 2005	211
C EC2 observations at the ARO 12m telescope February - June 2002	233
D EC2 observations at the ARO 12m telescope Nov 2002 & Feb 2003	241
E EC2 observations at the ARO 12m telescope April 2004	247
F EC2 observations at the JCMT 15m telescope June 2004	251
G EC2 observations at the ARO 12m telescope Feb-Mar 2005	255
H EC2 obs. at the MPIfR 100m telescope Dec 2002, May 2004, Nov 2005	275
I EC2 observations at the ARO 12m telescope Dec 2005 - Jan 2006	281
J EC1 observations at the ARO 12m telescope April 2004	293
K EC1 observations at the ARO 12m telescope March 2005	317
L EC1 observations at the OSO 20m telescope May 2005	335
M EC1 observations at the MPIfR 100m telescope Oct-Nov 2005	341
N Permanent electric dipole moments	345
O EC2 Chemical Model Results	349
List of Figures	359
List of Tables	367
References	371

The University of Manchester

ABSTRACT OF THESIS submitted by Paul Ruffle

for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and entitled

The effects of dust grains in two dissimilar regions at opposite ends of the Milky Way.
September 2006

I examine the detected effects of dust grains in two dissimilar regions at opposite ends of the Milky Way: firstly in explaining anomalous extinction values towards the Galactic bulge through observations of Planetary Nebulae (PNe); and secondly in explaining the apparent photon-dominated regions (PDRs) observed in metal-poor molecular clouds at the Galactic edge. Angular diameters, fluxes and extinction of compact PNe are derived from observations, providing evidence for steeper extinction towards the Bulge. I suggest that for the inner Galaxy the low-density warm ionized medium is the site of the anomalous extinction, and that low values of extinction can also be derived using dust models with a turnover radius of 0.08 microns. I then go on to examine the chemistry of Edge Clouds 1 and 2 (EC1 & EC2), molecular clouds with the largest galactocentric distances in the Milky Way. I present observations of both clouds and these are used to determine their physical characteristics. Chemical models are used to reproduce the abundances in EC2 and they indicate: heavy elements may be reduced by a factor of five relative to the solar neighbourhood; very low extinction due to a high gas to dust ratio; an enhanced cosmic ray ionisation rate; and a high UV field compared to local interstellar values. Observed high abundances of the radicals C_2H and CN are typical of PDRs, but at the Galactic edge, metal abundances are expected to be much reduced. In addition, although EC2 does contain young stars, there is no evidence of the late-type stars which produce dust grains, thereby justifying the assumption of a high ratio of UV flux to grain surface area. Finally, I note that shocks from an old supernova remnant may be the source of the structure and dynamics observed in EC2.

Declaration

I declare that no portion of the work referred to in the thesis has been submitted in support of an application for another degree or qualification of this or any other university or other institute of learning.

Copyright Statement

- (i) Copyright in text of this thesis rests with the Author. Copies (by any process) either in full, or of extracts, may be made only in accordance with instructions given by the Author and lodged in the John Rylands University Library of Manchester. Details may be obtained from the Librarian. This page must form part of any such copies made. Further copies (by any process) of copies made in accordance with such instructions may not be made without the permission (in writing) of the Author.
- (ii) The ownership of any intellectual property rights which may be described in this thesis is vested in The University of Manchester, subject to any prior agreement to the contrary, and may not be made available for use by third parties without the written permission of the University, which will prescribe the terms and conditions of any such agreement.
- (iii) Further information on the conditions under which disclosures and exploitation may take place is available from the Head of School of Physics and Astronomy.

The Galaxy, you know, is not simply a flat ovoid of any sort; nor is the periphery a closed curve. Actually, it is a double spiral, with at least eighty percent of the inhabited planets on the Main Arm. Terminus is the extreme outer end of the spiral arm, and we are at the other – since, what is the opposite end of a spiral?

Why, the center.

Second Foundation, Isaac Asimov (1953)

*The stars, like dust, encircle me
In the living mists of light;
And all of space I seem to see
In one vast burst of sight.*

The Stars Like Dust, Isaac Asimov (1955)

(Black) is like the silence of the body after death, the close of life.

Wassily Kandinsky (1911)

Why do you write to me ‘God should punish the English’? I have no close connection to either one or the other. I see only with deep regret that God punishes so many of His children for their numerous stupidities, for which only He Himself can be held responsible; in my opinion, only His nonexistence could excuse Him.

Albert Einstein (1915)

Dedication

To Philip. I wish I had known you better.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor, Tom Millar, for his help, support and advice during my time at Manchester. I also extend my gratitude to Albert Zijlstra, for steering me through my sojourn of Planetary Nebulae. To my mentor, Malcolm Gray, goes my appreciation for explaining the ‘gobstopper’ dust model and patiently listening (over several pints in *The Bull’s Head*) to my tales of woe in my first year. I thank Gary Fuller for many tips and explanations on radio astronomy, and David Howe for being a thoroughly decent chap (and an ex-Open University student). To Helen Roberts goes my appreciation for helping me to run our chemical kinetic models, to Christian Henkel my gratitude for his LVG calculations, and to Don Lubowich my thanks for all that ARO 12m telescope time.

To my son, Andrew, thanks for being proud of me, and my daughter, Lara, thanks for the sound advice on staying cool. To fellow PhD traveller and neutron wrangler Jim Grozier go my thanks for being just that.

I am also grateful to past and present members of the UMIST astrophysics group for their advice, support and good humour: Jim Woodall, Róisín Ni Chuimin, Laurence Sabin, Chris Yate, Andrew Markwick-Kemper, Joseph Birks, Stewart Williams, Simon Farrow, Khaled Edris, Holly Thomas, Daniel Wong-McSweeney, David Tideswell, Isidore Bedicoglou, Paul Woods, Mikako Matsuura, Hideko Nomura, Silvia Dalla, Nicolas Peretto, Eric Lagadec, Jane Buckle, Karen Willacy, and not forgetting Joan Sharp. I would also like to thank: Jeremy Walsh for helping the ‘young student’ at the NTT, Robert Zylka for helping with bolometer mapping at the IRAM 30m, Harold Butner and Jim Hodge at the JCMT 15m, Lars Eriksson at the OSO 20m, Ray Mackintosh at the OU for believing I could do it, Dan Evans for finding *The Crown* at Goostrey in the fog, and not forgetting Robert Simon, Ute Lisenfeld and Andrew Baker at the IRAM 30m in December 2003. It would be amiss of me to not mention the old phud-ders, fellow mature PhD students that I met at the PPARC 2002 summer school in

Leeds: Kim Clube, Avon Huxor, Dave Underwood and Mick Weston.

I am indebted to: the European Southern Observatory (ESO) for making time available on the New Technology Telescope (NTT); the Arizona Radio Observatory (ARO), Steward Observatory, University of Arizona for extensive time on the Kitt Peak 12 Meter telescope; the Max-Planck-Institut für Radioastronomie (MPIfR) for time on the Effelsberg 100m telescope; the Onsala Space Observatory (OSO), Chalmers University of Technology for time on the 20m telescope (including research funding from the European Community's Sixth Framework Programme); the James Clerk Maxwell Telescope (JCMT), operated by The Joint Astronomy Centre (JAC) on behalf of the Particle Physics and Astronomy Research Council (PPARC) of the United Kingdom, the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research, and the National Research Council of Canada; the Institut de Radio Astronomie Millimétrique (IRAM) Pico Veleta Observatory for time on the 30m telescope.

I must also thank PPARC for funding my studentship and The University of Manchester (formerly UMIST) for an additional travel grant. To the Open University goes credit for making my undergraduate success a reality, and the Institute of Physics for organising the Young Physicists' Conference (YPC) 2000 in Chester, where I first realised that studying for a PhD was not beyond my reach.

Data reduction was carried out using the packages SPECX (JCMT), CLASS, GREG, MOPSIC (GILDAS) and MIDAS (ESO). PNe images were restored using IRAF as distributed by the National Optical Astronomy Observatories, operated by the Association of Universities for Research in Astronomy, Inc., under contract to the National Science Foundation of the United States. Graphs, plots and diagrams were generated by the above data reduction packages or by OpenOffice, Excel or GnuPlot. Adobe Illustrator and Photoshop were used for post processing of PostScript and bitmap files respectively. Computing was provided by: a Compaq XP1000 Tru64 Unix workstation; an Intel system running SuSE Linux 9; and an Apple G5 iMac running OS X Tiger. Microsoft Windows was NOT used at any time! This thesis was typeset with \LaTeX and TeXShop on my iMac.

The Author

Paul Ruffle started his first career in the late sixties, working as a graphic artist in design studios and advertising agencies in London. In the mid eighties he got involved with computers and the subsequent desktop publishing (DTP) revolution. This in turn led to working for a large multinational corporation producing multilingual publications and CD-ROM based multimedia. He also ran his own company, Geodesy Ltd, providing production consultancy services and building internet web sites.

Despite his creative abilities, Paul always had a strong interest in science, and physics and astronomy in particular. When he was a young boy his father took him to the London Planetarium and bought him a planisphere – a simple set of plastic disks that showed the positions of the stars at any time or place. In the intervening years he lost the little device, but not a fascination with the stars.

So in 1989 he started studying, in his free time, for a physics degree with the Open University, and obtained his BSc (Hons) in Natural Science in 2002. Towards the end of his studies he became increasingly interested in astrophysics and at the same time discovered that doing a PhD as a mature student was not entirely ‘pie in the sky’. In early 2002 he contacted a number of research groups in the UK and was subsequently offered a PPARC funded full time research studentship at UMIST (now The University of Manchester).

Paul is a founder member of FUSION – The Open University Physics Society and edits their Newsletter and Web site. He served on the committee of NEXUS – the student section of the Institute of Physics, and redesigned the NEXUS web site. He is also a fellow of the Royal Astronomical Society and an associate member of the Institute of Physics.

In the course of two careers he has travelled extensively. He reads science (fact and fiction), philosophy, biography and art history. Other activities include gardening, painting, photography a little sailing, and learning to ride a horse!

Supporting Publications

Molecular Line Observations of Edge Cloud 2

T. J. Millar, D. A. Lubowich, H. Roberts, P. M. E. Ruffle, C. Henkel, G. Brammer and J. Pasachoff. In preparation, 2006.

Metal-poor molecular gas beyond the optical disk of the Galaxy

P. M. E. Ruffle, T. J. Millar, H. Roberts, C. Henkel and D. A. Lubowich. In *Astrochemistry Throughout the Universe: Recent Successes and Current Challenges, IAU Symposium 231, 29 August - 2 September, 2005 in Asilomar, California, USA*. Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Metal-poor Molecular Gas in Edge Cloud 2 (EC2)

P. M. E. Ruffle, T. J. Millar, H. Roberts, D. A. Lubowich, C. Henkel and G. Brammer. In *The dense interstellar medium in galaxies, Proceedings of the 4th Cologne-Bonn-Zermatt Symposium, Zermatt, Switzerland, 22-26 September 2003*. Springer proceedings in physics, Vol. 91, 2004.

Angular diameters, fluxes and extinction of compact planetary nebulae: further evidence for steeper extinction towards the bulge

P. M. E. Ruffle, A. A. Zijlstra, J. R. Walsh, M. D. Gray, K. Gesicki, D. Minniti and F. Comeron. *MNRAS*, 353, 796-812, September 2004.

Angular diameters, fluxes and extinction of compact planetary nebulae: further evidence for steeper extinction towards the bulge

A. A. Zijlstra, P. M. E. Ruffle and K. Gesicki. In *Asymmetric Planetary Nebulae III*, eds. M. Meixner, J. Kastner and N. Soker, *ASP Conference Series*, 313, 40-41, 2004.

The Composition at the Outer Edge of the Galaxy

D. A. Lubowich, G. Brammer, H. Roberts, T. J. Millar, C. Henkel, J. Pasachoff and P. M. E. Ruffle. In *Elemental Abundances in Old Stars and Damped Lyman-Systems, 25th meeting of the IAU, Joint Discussion 15, 22 July 2003, Sydney, Australia*, 2003.



Figure 1: (a) The author at the European Southern Observatory (ESO), La Silla, Chile. (b) the ESO NTT 3.5m, (c) the Max-Planck-Institut für Radioastronomie (MPIfR) Effelsberg 100m, (d) the Arizona Radio Observatory (ARO) 12m, (e) the Institut de Radio Astronomie Millimétrique (IRAM) 30m, (f) the James Clerk Maxwell (JCMT) 15m and (g) the Onsala Space Observatory (OSO) 20m telescopes.